



UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

---

In Re: Methyl Tertiary Butyl Ether (“MTBE”)  
Products Liability Litigation

Master File C.A. No.  
1:00-1898 (SAS)  
MDL 1358

---

**This Document Relates To:**

*City of Fresno v. Chevron U.S.A., Inc., et al.*,  
Case No. 04-Cv-04973

---

**DEFENDANTS’ NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT  
FOR LACK OF EVIDENCE PERTAINING TO CAUSATION**

Please take notice that Defendants<sup>1</sup> hereby move this Court, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 56, for summary judgment as to all of Plaintiff City of Fresno’s causes of action related to seventeen gasoline stations alleged to be sources of methyl tertiary butyl ether contamination. This motion asserts that Plaintiff lacks sufficient evidence against the moving Defendants to establish causation.

This Motion is based upon the accompanying memorandum of law in support and the attached materials filed with the Court, as well as such other argument and evidence as the Court may consider at any hearing in consideration of this motion.

---

<sup>1</sup> The accompanying motion is brought on behalf of Coastal Chem, Inc. (“Coastal Chem”); Duke Energy Merchants, LLC and Northridge Petroleum Marketing U.S. (collectively “Duke”); Kern Oil & Refining Co. (“Kern Oil”); Tesoro Corporation (f/k/a Tesoro Petroleum Corporation); Tesoro Refining & Marketing Company (erroneously named by Plaintiff as Tesoro Refining & Marketing Company, Inc.) (collectively “Tesoro”); and Valero Marketing & Supply Company and Valero Refining Company-California (collectively “Valero”).

Dated: March 15, 2013

/s/ Brent H. Allen (by permission)

Brent H. Allen  
James Layman  
GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP  
2101 L Street, N.W., Suite 1000  
Washington, D.C. 20037

*Attorneys for Coastal Chem, Inc.*

/s/ Brian M. Ledger (by permission)

Brian M. Ledger  
GORDEON & REES LLP  
101 W. Broadway, Suite 1600  
San Diego, CA 92101  
Tel: (619) 696-6700  
Fax: (619) 696-7124

*Attorney for Kern Oil & Refining Co.*

/s/ M. Coy Connelly (by permission)

M. Coy Connelly  
Kimberly G. Albert  
BRACEWELL & GIULIANI  
711 Louisiana Street, Suite 2300  
Pennzoil Place – South Tower  
Houston, TX 77002-2770  
Tel: (713) 223-2300  
Fax: (713) 221-1212

*Counsel for Valero Marketing & Supply  
Company and Valero Refining Company-  
California.*

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ James R. Wedeking

James R. Wedeking  
David T. Buente, Jr.  
SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005

*Attorneys for Duke Energy Merchants LLC, Duke  
Energy Merchants California, Inc., Duke Energy  
Trading and Marketing LLC, and Northridge  
Petroleum Marketing U.S.*

/s/ Colleen P. Doyle (by permission)

Colleen P. Doyle  
Diana Pfeffer Martin  
Suedy Torabi  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS  
550 South Hope Street, Suite 2000  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Tel: (213) 532-2000  
Fax: (213) 532-2020

*Counsel for Tesoro Corporation (f/k/a Tesoro  
Petroleum Corporation) and Tesoro Refining &  
Marketing Company*